

1 ROB BONTA
Attorney General of California
2 ANYA M. BINSACCA
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
3 KRISTIN A. LISKA
KRISTEN C.A. KIDO
4 Deputy Attorney General
State Bar No. 315994
5 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
6 Telephone: (415) 510-3916
Fax: (415) 703-5480
7 E-mail: Kristin.Liska@doj.ca.gov
Attorneys for Defendants
8

9
10 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
11 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
12 WESTERN DIVISION
13

14 **UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,**
15 Plaintiff,
16 **v.**

17 **THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA;**
18 **GAVIN C. NEWSOM, in his Official**
19 **Capacity as Governor of California;**
20 **KAREN ROSS, in her Official**
21 **Capacity as Secretary of the**
22 **California Department of Food &**
23 **Agriculture; ERICA PAN, in her**
24 **Official Capacity as Director of the**
25 **California Department of Public**
26 **Health; and ROB BONTA, in his**
27 **Official Capacity as Attorney General**
28 **of California,**

Defendants.

Case No. 2:25-cv-06230-MCS-AGR

**JOINT STIPULATION SETTING
[PROPOSED] BRIEFING
SCHEDULE**

Judge: The Honorable Mark C. Scarsi
Trial Date: Not scheduled
Action Filed: 7/09/2025

1 Plaintiff United States of America; Defendants the State of California,
2 Governor Gavin Newsom, Secretary Karen Ross, Director Erica Pan, and Attorney
3 General Rob Bonta; Proposed Defendant-Intervenors Humane World for Animals,
4 Animal Legal Defense Fund, Animal Equality, The Humane League, Farm
5 Sanctuary, Compassion in World, Farming, Inc., and Animal Outlook (“Proposed
6 Animal Welfare Defendant-Intervenors”); and Proposed Defendant-Intervenor
7 Association of California Egg Farmers, by and through their respective counsel,
8 hereby agree and stipulate as follows:

9 1. On July 9, 2025, Plaintiff United States of America filed this suit against
10 Defendants challenging several California laws and regulations as preempted by
11 federal law.

12 2. On July 28, 2025, Proposed Animal Welfare Defendant-Intervenors filed
13 an unopposed motion to intervene in this matter. Their motion remains currently
14 pending before the Court, with a hearing date of September 22, 2025.

15 3. On August 1, 2025, Proposed Defendant-Intervenor Association of
16 California Egg Farmers filed an unopposed motion to intervene in this matter.
17 Their motion remains currently pending before the Court, with a hearing date of
18 September 22, 2025.

19 4. On August 7, 2025, this Court granted the motion to extend the time for
20 Defendants to respond to the complaint until September 10, 2025.

21 5. On August 27, 2025, the parties and all Proposed Intervenor-Defendants
22 conducted a meet and confer call as required by Local Rule 7-3. On the call,
23 Defendants stated that they intended to file a motion to dismiss. Plaintiff
24 represented it intended to cross-move for summary judgment in response to that
25 motion. All Proposed Intervenor-Defendants also indicated they intend to file
26 proposed dispositive motions at the same time that Defendants file their motion to
27 dismiss.
28

1 6. On September 2, 2025, Plaintiff filed a First Amended Complaint. Under
2 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 15(a)(3), Defendants' response to the First
3 Amendment Complaint is now due September 16, 2025.

4 7. In order to facilitate the resolution of the forthcoming motions, the parties
5 and all Proposed Intervenor-Defendants have discussed a proposed schedule for
6 briefing and arguing the motions. Specifically, the parties propose the Court adopt
7 the following schedule for briefing and argument:

- 8 • Defendants' Motion to Dismiss and Proposed Intervenor-Defendants'
9 proposed Motions for Judgment on the Pleadings or Motions for
10 Summary Judgment due Tuesday, September 16, 2025
- 11 • Plaintiff's single Consolidated Opposition and Cross-Motion for
12 Summary Judgment due Thursday, October 16, 2025
- 13 • Defendants' and Proposed Defendant-Intervenors' individual Combined
14 Reply and Oppositions due Monday, November 17, 2025.
- 15 • Plaintiff's single Consolidated Reply due Monday, December 8, 2025
- 16 • Hearing set for Monday, January 5, 12, or 26, 2026

17 8. This proposed schedule follows the briefing schedule set forth for a
18 motion set for hearing more than 70 days after filing with a few short extensions of
19 time to account for the parties' intention to file consolidated briefing on cross-
20 motions that would provide a final resolution for this matter.

21 9. In addition, the parties propose the following word limits for the briefs:

- 22 • Defendants' and Proposed Intervenors' Motions: 7,000 words each
 - 23 • Plaintiff's single Consolidated Opposition and Cross-Motion: 10,500
24 words
 - 25 • Defendants' and Proposed Intervenors' individual Combined Reply and
26 Oppositions: 7,000 words each
 - 27 • Plaintiff's single Consolidated Reply: 4,500 words
- 28

1 10. These proposed word limits provide Defendants and Proposed
2 Intervenor with 7,000 words for their motions and their combined reply and
3 oppositions, consistent with Local Rule 11-6. Since Plaintiff intends to file a single
4 consolidated opposition and cross-motion and a single consolidated reply instead of
5 three separate oppositions and three separate replies, the parties propose that
6 Plaintiff receive 1.5 times the usual word limit under Local Rule 11-6, as listed
7 above. This expanded word limit will allow for Plaintiff to address the arguments
8 raised by all three motions in a single brief and thereby facilitate the efficient
9 resolution of the motions and this matter.

10 A proposed order is attached to this Joint Stipulation.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 Dated: September 9, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

2
3 RILEY SAFER HOLMES & CANCILA
4 LLP

5 /s/ Bruce A. Wagman
6 Bruce A. Wagman

7 *Counsel for Proposed Defendant-*
8 *Intervenors Humane World for Animals,*
9 *Animal Legal Defense Fund, Animal*
10 *Equality, The Humane League, Farm*
11 *Sanctuary, Compassion in World*
12 *Farming, Inc., and Animal Outlook*

ROB BONTA
Attorney General of California
ANYA M. BINSACCA
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
KRISTEN C.A. KIDO
Deputy Attorney General

/s/ Kristin Liska

KRISTIN A. LISKA
Deputy Attorney General
Attorneys for Defendants

11 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
12 HALE AND DORR LLP

13 /s/ Brian M. Boynton
14 Brian M. Boynton
15 Thomas G. Saunders (pro hac vice
16 pending)

17 *Attorneys for Proposed Defendant-*
18 *Intervenor Association of California Egg*
19 *Farmers*

BRETT A. SHUMATE
Assistant Attorney General
YAAKOV M. ROTH
Principal Deputy Assistant Attorney
General
ERIC HAMILTON
Deputy Assistant Attorney General
ALEXANDER K. HAAS
Director, Federal Programs Branch
JACQUELINE COLEMAN SNEAD
Assistant Director, Federal Programs
Branch

/s/ John Bailey

JOHN BAILEY
Counsel to the Assistant Attorney
General
U.S. Department of Justice

21 BILAL A. ESSAYLI
22 United States Attorney
23 DAVID M. HARRIS
24 Assistant United States Attorney
25 Chief, Civil Division
26 DANIEL A. BECK
27 Assistant United States Attorney
28 Chief, Complex and Defensive
Litigation Section
JOSEPH W. TURSI
Assistant United States Attorney
Attorneys for Plaintiff

ATTESTATION OF SIGNATURES (L. R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2))

I, Kristin A. Liska, the attorney whose ECF credentials are being used in connection with this filing, hereby attest pursuant to Local Rule 5-4.3.4(a)(2), that all signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized this filing.

Dated: September 11, 2025

/s/ Kristin A. Liska

KRISTIN A. LISKA
Deputy Attorney General

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case Name: *United States of America v. The State of California, et al.*

Case No.: **2:25-cv-06230-MCS-AGR**

I, Vanessa Jordan, hereby certify that on September 11, 2025, I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

- **JOINT STIPULATION SETTING [PROPOSED] BRIEFING SCHEDULE**
- **[PROPOSED] ORDER SETTING BRIEFING SCHEDULE**

I certify that all participants in the case who are registered CM/ECF users will be served electronically by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America the foregoing is true and correct.

This declaration was executed on September 11, 2025, at San Francisco, California.

Vanessa Jordan
Declarant

Vanessa Jordan
Signature